

'The Case for a Human Right to Health in a Globalizing World'

Gina Adela Ding

(Mphil 2009)

University of Aberystwyth

Summary:

This thesis concentrates on health as a human right. Health has been recognized as a human right in various international documents and every country in the world is a part to at least one human right treaty that deals with health related rights. However, it is arguable that the human right to health (as part of economic, social and cultural rights) is hardly given the same degree of importance as civil and political rights. The question explored in this thesis is as such: are we moving towards a universal recognition of the human right to health; and accordingly, what does a right to health really entail under current international law; and how is the development of this human right in light of globalization? The overall aim is to explain the content and meaning of the human right to health and explore the significance and development of this right. Globalization is used to provide a reality platform to illustrate the daily struggle for the human right to health, especially in the context of developing countries. Of particular importance is the conclusion that significant progress has been made in the field of human rights and health. However, global health challenges and threats are real and they can seriously endanger the realization of all human rights, not just the human right to health.

CONTENTS PAGE

Introduction	1
1. Structure of the Thesis.....	2
2. The Right to Health: Terminology	6
3. History of the Development of Health as an International Human Right	11
4. Concluding Summary	18
Chapter One: Health in a Human Rights Context	
Introduction	19
1. The Idea of Universal Human Rights	20
2. Human Rights in Theory – Its Emergence and Development	
2.1 Early Development	23
2.2 Human Rights Post World War – Its Modern Appearance	24
2.3 A Divergence of Human Rights Ideologies	29
3. Codification of the Right to Health	
3.1 International Documents	31
3.2 Other Relevant International Instruments	35
3.3 Regional Documents	37
4. The Concept of Health	39
4.1 Exploring the Definitions of Health	
4.1.1 The 'Naturalist' and 'Normativist' Schools of Thought	39
4.1.2 From Greek Philosophers to the World Health Organization	41
5. Is a Definition of Health Necessary?	45
6. Understanding the Contents of the Right to Health	48
7. Is there a Right to Health? - A Debate	55
8. Concluding Summary	65

Chapter Two: Towards a Further Understanding of Health as a Human Right

Introduction	66
1. Progressive Realization	67
2. Obligations for Health under International Human Rights Law	76
2.1 The Obligation to Respect	77.
2.2 The Obligation to Protect	81
2.3 The Obligation to Fulfill	84
3. Mechanisms for Monitoring the Right to Health	88
4. Case Law	94
4.1 The Right to Life	94
4.2 General Evaluation	100
5. Other Implementation of the Right to Health through Case Law	101
5.1 Latin America	101
5.2 Philippines	105
5.3 General Evaluation	107
6. Concluding Summary	107

Chapter Three: Global Social Realities and Stark Disparities – Managing Health under Globalization

Introduction	111
1. A Brief Inroad into Statistical Realities	113
2. Poverty and Development as a Public Health Issue: Conventional Wisdoms and Complex Realities	117
3. Managing Healthcare under Globalization: An Introduction	123
3.1 The Definitions of Globalization	125
3.2 Causal Pathways between Globalization and Health	129
3.3 Institutional Determinant	130
3.3.1 Debt and Structural Adjustment	134

3.3.1(a) Privatization of Health Care Systems and Introduction of User Fees	138
3.3.1(b) The Effectiveness of Structural Adjustments Programmes	142
3.4 Economic Determinant	145
3.4.1 Free Trade: But Is It Really ‘Free’?	147
3.5 Environmental Determinant	156.
3.6 Social-Cultural Determinant	158
4. Conclusion	160

Chapter Four: Highlighting Access to Medicines as an Issue under Health and Human Rights

Introduction	162
1. Essential Medicines	164
2. TRIPS Agreement and Access to Drugs	165.
2.1 How Does TRIPS Work?	169
2.2 Compulsory Licensing	174
3. Drugs Prices – Why Does it Matter So?	178
4. Generic Drug Industries	181
4.1 The Influence of the Pharmaceutical Industry in the Issue of Access to Medicines	184
4.2 The Industry Stance and the Dispelling of Myths	188
5. Developments in the Debate on Access to Medicine and Intellectual Property ...	196
5.1 Facts of <i>Treatment Action Campaign v. Minister of Health, High Court of South Africa</i>	204
5.1.1 Decision of the Case	207
5.2 The Case of <i>Novartis Against India: Novartis AG, Switzerland v. Cancer Patients Aid Association, India</i>	210
5.2.1 The Significance of the Case	213
6. Conclusion	216

Conclusion218
Bibliography.....227