'The Case for a Human Right to Health in a Globalizing World'

Gina Adela Ding

(Mphil 2009)
University of Aberystwyth
Summary:

This thesis concentrates on health as a human right. Health has been recognized as a human right in various international documents and every country in the world is a part to at least one human right treaty that deals with health related rights. However, it is arguable that the human right to health (as part of economic, social and cultural rights) is hardly given the same degree of importance as civil and political rights. The question explored in this thesis is as such: are we moving towards a universal recognition of the human right to health; and accordingly, what does a right to health really entail under current international law; and how is the development of this human right in light of globalization? The overall aim is to explain the content and meaning of the human right to health and explore the significance and development of this right. Globalization is used to provide a reality platform to illustrate the daily struggle for the human right to health, especially in the context of developing countries. Of particular importance is the conclusion that significant progress has been made in the field of human rights and health. However, global health challenges and threats are real and they can seriously endanger the realization of all human rights, not just the human right to health.
CONTENTS PAGE

Introduction ........................................................................................................................................1

1. Structure of the Thesis ................................................................................................................2

2. The Right to Health: Terminology ..............................................................................................6

3. History of the Development of Health as an International Human Right .............................11

4. Concluding Summary ..................................................................................................................18

Chapter One: Health in a Human Rights Context

Introduction ........................................................................................................................................19

1. The Idea of Universal Human Rights ......................................................................................20

2. Human Rights in Theory – Its Emergence and Development

   2.1 Early Development .............................................................................................................23

   2.2 Human Rights Post World War – Its Modern Appearance .............................................24

   2.3 A Divergence of Human Rights Ideologies ......................................................................29

3. Codification of the Right to Health

   3.1 International Documents .................................................................................................31

   3.2 Other Relevant International Instruments .........................................................................35

   3.3 Regional Documents ........................................................................................................37

4. The Concept of Health ................................................................................................................39

   4.1 Exploring the Definitions of Health

     4.1.1 The 'Naturalist' and 'Normativist' Schools of Thought .............................................39

     4.1.2 From Greek Philosophers to the World Health Organization .................................41

5. Is a Definition of Health Necessary? .......................................................................................45

6. Understanding the Contents of the Right to Health ..................................................................48

7. Is there a Right to Health? - A Debate ....................................................................................55

8. Concluding Summary .................................................................................................................65
Chapter Two: Towards a Further Understanding of Health as a Human Right

Introduction .........................................................................................................................66

1. Progressive Realization .................................................................................................67

2. Obligations for Health under International Human Rights Law ...............................76

2.1 The Obligation to Respect ..........................................................................................77.

2.2 The Obligation to Protect .........................................................................................81

2.3 The Obligation to Fulfill ...........................................................................................84

3. Mechanisms for Monitoring the Right to Health .........................................................88

4. Case Law ......................................................................................................................94

4.1 The Right to Life .......................................................................................................94

4.2 General Evaluation ...................................................................................................100

5. Other Implementation of the Right to Health through Case Law ...............................101

5.1 Latin America ..........................................................................................................101

5.2 Philippines ...............................................................................................................105

5.3 General Evaluation ...................................................................................................107

6. Concluding Summary .................................................................................................107

Chapter Three: Global Social Realities and Stark Disparities – Managing Health under Globalization

Introduction ........................................................................................................................111

1. A Brief Inroad into Statistical Realities .......................................................................113

2. Poverty and Development as a Public Health Issue: Conventional Wisdoms and Complex Realities .................................................................................................................................117


3.1 The Definitions of Globalization ..............................................................................125

3.2 Causal Pathways between Globalization and Health ..............................................129

3.3 Institutional Determinant .........................................................................................130

3.3.1 Debt and Structural Adjustment ...........................................................................134